

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ד – בהמה המקשה

דף עג – Daf 73

1. דם ידות כלים vs. protruding limbs which stand to be cut

Ravina says that the protruding limb of a fetus is *metamei* the rest of the fetus. Although it would seem to be *tumah* in a concealed area – *tumah in a concealed area* (the point of attachment), *the protruding limb of a fetus stands to be severed*, and *anything which stands to be severed is considered as if it was already severed*, and is not considered “concealed.” The Gemara asks if this specifically follows Rebbe Meir, who says in a Mishnah: *regarding all handles of utensils which are too long, and one intends to cut off the surplus amount, one only needs to immerse the handle in a mikveh until the measure he intends to keep, but the extra length is considered cut off and does not require tevilah.* The other Tanna disagrees, requiring the entire handle’s immersion. The Gemara answers that Ravina’s answer can conform with all Tannaim, because *food attachments which stand to be cut apart are considered already separated, and the parts are touching each other.* Therefore, the fetus and its limb are considered detached (and not “concealed”), and touching each other.

2. שחיטה עושה ניפול *machlokes* if אבר המדולדל

In the Mishnah, the Rabbonon and Rebbe Meir argued whether the *shechitah* of the mother prevents the fetus’s protruding limb from becoming *tamei*. The Rabbonon said it does, like *shechitah* of a *tereifah* prevents it from becoming *tamei*, and Rebbe Meir said this is only for *something which is its own body*, but not for the protruding limb, which is not part of the mother’s body. Amoraim debate if this *machlokes* also applies to *shechitah* preventing *tumah* from אבר המדולדל – *a limb which is mostly detached from the animal but is dangling from it.* Rebbe Shimon ben Lakish says that the same *machlokes* applies to these limbs: the Rabbonon say the *shechitah* prevents them from being *tamei* as *נבילה*, whereas Rebbe Meir holds it does not. Rebbe Yochanan says that regarding a limb of the animal itself, *all agree that shechitah does not effect [halachic] detachment from the animal*, and Rebbe Meir would agree it is *tahor*. Rebbe Yose bar Rebbe Chanina explains: *this [אבר המדולדל] is part of [the shechted animal’s] body, והאין לאו גופה – but that [עובר’s protruding limb] is not part of [the animal’s] body.*

3. הכל מודים שמיתה עושה ניפול

Rav Yitzchak bar Yosef said in Rebbe Yochanan’s name: *all agree that death effects [halachic] detachment for dangling limbs, ואין שחיטה עושה ניפול – but shechitah does not effect detachment.* Since Tannaim argue about *shechitah’s* effectiveness for an עובר’s protruding limb, this statement must instead refer to the dangling limb of the animal itself. If the animal was *shechted*, all agree the limb is considered attached and *tahor*, and if it dies, all agree it is considered *detached*, and not *נבילה*. [Although אבר מן החי is also *tamei*, this is only true for a “limb” consisting of bone, sinew, and meat. If meat alone is torn off, it would be *tahor*.] The Gemara objects that the law that death effects detachment is already taught by a Mishnah, in which Rebbe Meir says that if an animal dies with a limb and meat dangling from it, *the meat requires preparation of a liquid to make it susceptible to tumah*, and the limb is *tamei* as אבר מן החי, but is not *tamei* as *נבילה*. The Gemara proceeds to explain the novelty of the second half of Rebbe Yochanan’s statement.

Siman – Giant Ostrich Egg

When the man who fashioned a **giant ostrich egg** into an elaborate **pot marked the handle which was too long where he was going to cut it before toiveleing it**, his partner who made a model of a **hanging limb of an animal out of eggs to show how שחיטה עושה ניפול**, was dismayed when the animal he was using to copy from died, and **הכל מודים שמיתה עושה ניפול**.

דף עג | DAF 73

Giant Ostrich Egg



When the man who fashioned a giant ostrich egg into an elaborate pot marked the handle which was too long where he was going to cut it before *toiveleing* it, his partner who made a model of a hanging limb of an animal out of eggs to show how שחיטה עושה ניפול, was dismayed when the animal he was using to copy from died, and הכל מודים שמיתה עושה ניפול.

3 things to remember

1. ידות כלים vs. protruding limbs which stand to be cut
2. אבר המדולדל, machlokes if שחיטה עושה ניפול
3. הכל מודים שמיתה עושה ניפול

